

**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION**  
**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**AUGUST 23, 2021**  
**HR-2021-067051**  
**1805 E. 3<sup>RD</sup> STREET**  
**HERRERA HOUSE**

## **PROPOSAL**

---

Replace the front doors and paint the historic house, add a new window to an existing or new rear wall opening, and construct a 1-story rear addition. Previous restoration work was approved administratively.

## **PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS**

---

The proposed project involves eight parts:

- 1) Replace the non-historic front doors with paneled partially glazed doors.
- 2) Replace some glazing in historic window sashes.
- 3) Replace the metal roof with composition shingles with a wood-shake profile.
- 4) Paint the house to match the historic color (yellow).
- 5) Possibly change window and door openings on the historic rear wall.
- 6) Replace a historic rear window with a new window with unknown sash material.
- 7) Construct an uncovered wood deck behind the rear (south) wall of the historic house.
- 8) Construct a 1-story rear addition. The addition is set back approximately 24' from the front wall and has an unknown footprint. A flat-roofed hyphen likely clad in hardiplank connects the new construction to the historic house. The addition will likely be clad in board-and-batten and horizontal hardiplank siding and capped by a likely cross-gabled roof, with a slope, eave depth, and shingles matching those of the historic house. Windows are single-hung and fixed with an unknown sash material; paired sliding glass doors on the hyphen's east wall provide access to the wood deck between the historic house and addition.

## **ARCHITECTURE**

---

One-story, L-plan, cross-gabled building; vertical board-and-batten siding; 4:4 wood-sash windows; shed porch with two entry doors; National Folk style.

## **STANDARDS FOR REVIEW**

---

The City of Austin's Historic Design Standards are based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and are used to evaluate projects on historic landmarks. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

### Repair and Alterations

#### *General Standards*

*1.1 Do not remove intact historic material from the exterior of a building.*

*1.2 Always attempt repair first. Replacement should only be undertaken when absolutely necessary, and for the smallest area possible.*

*1.3 When historic material must be replaced due to damage or deterioration, replacement material should look the same, perform reliably within the existing construction, and, in most cases, be made of the same material.*

The proposed project repairs and retains historic wood siding, windows, and trim. Where replacement of boards or battens is necessary due to deterioration, replacements will match historic materials and profiles. The project meets these standards.

*1.4 Do not attempt to re-create an architectural detail or element without proof that it existed on the building historically.*

The proposed project replaces plain wood porch posts with turned wood posts matching the profile of existing engaged posts. The project meets this standard.

*1.5 When demolishing additions or features that were built after the building's period of significance, minimize damage to the building.*

The proposed project replaces rear additions in poor condition with a new addition. The project meets this standard.

#### *Roofs*

*3.1 When replacing roof material, use a material that is appropriate to the building's history and character.*

*3.5 Owners of landmark properties must replace roofs with material that approximates the appearance of the historic or existing roof material.*

*d. Standing seam metal roofs, despite their historic look, are generally not acceptable for historic landmarks unless the owner can document that the building historically had a standing seam roof.*

The proposed project replaces a metal roof with dimensional shingles that mimic the appearance of the building's original wood-shingled roof. The project meets these standards.

*3.2 When replacing roof material, retain the configuration; pitch; soffit detailing; character-defining features such as chimney, gutters, and ventilation systems; and design, configuration, and detailing of eaves.*

*3.3 Retain and repair historic decorative roof elements.*

*3.4 Do not add decorative roof elements that were not historically present.*

The proposed project retains the roof form and character-defining features, including decorative trim, and does not add any elements not historically present. The project meets these standards.

#### *Exterior Walls and Trim*

*4.1 Repair, rather than replace, historic material, unless it is deteriorated beyond the point of stabilization or restoration.*

The proposed project repairs existing wood siding on the north, south, east, and west walls. The project meets this standard.

*4.2 When replacement or patching is required, use a compatible material that has a matching profile and texture, and that will not damage the historic material.*

Where replacement of boards or battens is necessary due to deterioration, replacements will match historic materials and profiles. The project meets this standard.

*4.7 Obtain historic approval before changing exterior paint colors or painting unpainted masonry.*

The proposed project includes repainting the house (currently aqua) a canary yellow color. This color was matched to a historic building element and aligns with the recollections of Herrera family members. The project meets this standard.

*4.8 Do not remove or replace exterior cladding and trim for additional insulation.*

The project does not remove exterior cladding or trim and meets this standard.

#### *Windows, Doors, and Screens*

*5.1 Repair, rather than replace, historic windows, doors, and screens; and their trim, surrounds, sidelights, transoms, and shutters, unless they are deteriorated beyond the point of stabilization or restoration. Retain windows if 50% or more of the wood or metal sash members are intact.*

The historic windows, trim, and shutters (on the easternmost window on the front wall) will be retained and repaired. Glazing on some walls will be replaced with new glazing in the historic sashes; information on the location and scale of the replacement is pending. The project meets this standard, though staff should carefully review revised elevations for accuracy before the project is released; the elevations provided do not show an existing set of shutters or a historic insect screen.

*5.7 If replacing a non-original door, identify the historic style of the door through research, or look to nearby similar properties to guide the choice of a replacement.*

*5.8 If a historic window or door is missing, replace it with a new unit based on documentation of the historic feature. If no documentation exists, use a new design compatible with the historic opening and the historic character of the building.*

The non-original front doors are proposed to be replaced with 4-panel doors with a glazed top panel. The project does not meet this standard.

*5.13 Do not enlarge, move, or enclose historic window or door openings unless required by an addition. If an opening is being used to connect to an addition, retain the size and configuration of the opening to the greatest extent possible.*

*5.14 New door or window openings must be limited, appropriate for the building, and compatible with the architectural character.*

The proposed project retains historic window and door openings on the north, east, and west walls. Information is pending on historic openings in the south (rear) wall.

#### *Porches*

*6.1 Repair, rather than replace, historic porch decking, piers, columns, railings, skirting, and trim, unless they are too deteriorated.*

The proposed project retains engaged turned posts and replaces plain replacement posts with turned posts replicating the engaged profile. The concrete decking will be retained with the same dimensions. The project meets this standard, though

staff should carefully review revised elevations for accuracy before the project is released; the elevations provided do not show all existing locations of porch posts.

*6.2 If it is necessary to replace historic elements, use compatible material with matching dimensions and details. Compatible materials include wood, rot-resistant material, or matching masonry and concrete.*

*6.3 Maintain porch dimensions and height.*

The proposed project maintains the porch dimensions and height. The concrete decking will be retained with the same dimensions. The project meets this standard.

*6.4 Maintain the open nature of front porches.*

The proposed project does not enclose the front porch and meets this standard.

## Residential Additions

### *Location*

*1.1 Locate additions to the rear and sides of historic buildings to minimize visual impact.*

The proposed addition is located at the rear of the historic building, 24' behind the front gabled wall, and preserves the building's form. The project meets this standard.

*1.5 Minimize the loss of historic fabric by connecting additions to the existing building through the least possible invasive location and means.*

The proposed addition is connected to the rear of the existing building, where non-historic additions in poor condition were previously removed. The project meets this standard.

*1.6 Additions are not appropriate for all historic landmarks and will be evaluated on a case-by-case basis.*

Staff believes that the location, design, and materials of the proposed addition are generally compatible with and differentiated from the historic building. The scale and massing are subordinate to the small one-story historic building. The project meets this standard.

### *Scale, Massing, and Height*

*2.1 Design an addition to complement the scale and massing of the historic building, including height. The addition must appear subordinate to the historic building.*

The proposed addition is one story high, with an 18'-high ridgeline that matches the height of the historic ridgeline; the height of the connecting hyphen is unknown. Attached to the rear wall of the historic house with massing that echoes the historic building around an interior courtyard, the addition is subordinate in location and massing. The project meets this standard.

*2.2 Minimize the appearance of the addition from the street faced by the historic building's front wall.*

*a. If the addition connects to the historic building's rear wall, step in the addition's side walls at least one foot (1') from the side walls of the historic building.*

The west wall of the proposed addition is stepped in from the west wall of the historic house at an unknown distance. This should be reviewed prior to release of plans.

*b. The historic building's overall shape as viewed from the street must appear relatively unaltered.*

The proposed addition is connected to the rear wall of the historic house with a lower-height hyphen, leaving the historic house's shape intact. The project meets this standard.

### *Design and Style*

*3.1 Design additions to be compatible with and differentiated from the historic building, if they are visible from the street.*

*a. Design proportions and patterns such as window-to-wall area ratios, floor-to-floor heights, fenestration patterns, and bay divisions to increase compatibility.*

*b. Do not replicate the design or details of the existing building to a degree that the addition might be mistaken as historic.*

The proposed addition is generally compatible with and differentiated from the existing building. The hyphen—including its roof height, roof shape, and contemporary windows and sliding doors—and modern materials will ensure that the addition will not be mistaken as historic. The east and west (side) walls of the addition do not include any windows, so window-to-wall area ratios and fenestration patterns are not compatible with the historic building. Elevations of the addition's rear wall were not provided. The project somewhat meets this standard, according to what plans were reviewed.

*3.2 No particular architectural style is required for addition design. Designs in both traditional and contemporary styles can successfully achieve compatibility and differentiation with historic buildings.*

The proposed addition is designed in a stripped-down style that references the historic house. The project meets this standard.

#### *Roofs*

*4.1 If an addition will be visible from a street on the front or side, design its roof form and slope to complement the roof on the historic building.*

No roof plan was provided, but the addition appears to have a cross-gabled roof that matches the roof form and slope of the historic house. The project appears to meet this standard, though staff should review the roof plan before the project is released.

*4.2 Use roof materials that match or have similar color, texture, and other visual qualities as the roof on the historic building.*

The addition roof materials will match the roof materials on the historic building. The project meets this standard.

#### *Exterior Walls*

*5.1 If an addition will be visible from a street on the front or side, use exterior wall materials that are compatible with those on the historic building in scale, type, material, size, finish, and texture.*

*5.2 Differentiate the exterior wall materials of the addition from those of the historic building. This could be accomplished by using different materials, using the same materials with different dimensions, or changing trim type or dimensions.*

The proposed addition likely will be clad in board-and-batten and horizontal hardiplank siding that is differentiated from the historic house. Colors are still pending. The project appears to meet this standard, though staff should review final colors and materials before the project is released.

#### *Windows, Screens, and Doors*

*6.1 If an addition will be visible from a street on the front or side, use windows that are compatible with those on the existing building in terms of material, fenestration pattern, size, proportion, configuration, and profile.*

The addition does not include windows on side walls; see discussion under standard 3.1.b. If windows are added, vinyl is not appropriate for an addition to a historic landmark.

---

### **COMMITTEE FEEDBACK**

*May 2021:* Replace metal roof with dimensional shingles and retain all windows possible. Committee members were supportive of the addition's roof pitch and form and requested perspective views.

*August 2021:* Consider ways to differentiate the addition from the historic house, including siding profiles and fascia details. Committee members were supportive of the addition's location and massing.

---

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Approve the project with the following project conditions and a complete and accurate set of supporting material with the information noted below. Staff requested the listed items via email in May, June, and August, as well as in the staff report for the May 26 Commission meeting.

Recommended project conditions for approval:

1. Period-appropriate front doors based on historic doors from similar houses in the area;
2. Retention of existing openings and historic windows and doors on the rear wall;
3. Confirmation that the historic wood siding on the rear wall will be retained and repaired;
4. Retention and repair of the wood-frame insect screen on the west wall, as well as any other historic screens;
5. Appropriate window sash material for the addition (not vinyl);
6. Addition of one 1-over-1 window to both the east and west walls of the addition; a 1-over-1 window with an identical sill height as and similar dimensions to the historic windows on the existing house's east and west walls is recommended;
7. Review of a rear elevation for compatibility;

8. Cladding materials, patterns, and colors for the addition that are differentiated from and compatible with the historic house; and
9. A minimum addition setback of 1' from the western wall; a greater setback is strongly recommended for the historic landmark.

Provide complete and accurate supporting material that includes the conditions listed above, as well as the following items:

1. Roof plan
2. Section showing the historic rear wall that includes existing openings and historic windows and doors (see Condition Assessment Report figures 4.22, 4.28, and 4.32)
3. Rear elevation
4. Elevations showing existing conditions, if possible (*recommended, not required*)
5. Specifications for the proposed paint colors for the historic house
6. Accurate location of the east-facing front door
7. Addition of the existing triangular fascia on the north side of the porch to A201
8. Addition of the existing shutters to the easternmost window to A201
9. Addition of the existing porch post locations to A203
10. Notations of where glazing is proposed to be replaced in the existing sashes, as well as a written description of how that replacement will be completed
11. Information on whether recreated insect screens will be built for other historic window openings, per the recommendation in section 3.6 of the Condition Assessment Report
12. Information on the height of the hyphen and the footprint of the addition
13. Accurate details in plan notes. Staff requests from previous plans:
  - a. Plan notes 5 and 6 should specify exact material, size, and slope/profile.
  - b. The plan notes show correct and incorrect eave soffit details. The boxed eave detail marked as incorrect is similar to what appears on the house and seems to conflict with note 4. All historic details will need to be correct on the drawings before they're released.
  - c. The exterior cladding trim and windows notes on G002 conflict with the retention and restoration of existing elements.

## LOCATION MAP



SUBJECT TRACT



PENDING CASE



ZONING BOUNDARY

1" = 166'

## NOTIFICATIONS

CASE#: PR 21-036097

LOCATION: 1805 E 3RD ST

This product is for informational purposes and may not have been prepared for or be suitable for legal, engineering, or surveying purposes. It does not represent an on-the-ground survey and represents only the approximate relative location of property boundaries.

This product has been produced by CTM for the sole purpose of geographic reference. No warranty is made by the City of Austin regarding specific accuracy or completeness.



## PROPERTY INFORMATION

---

### *Photos*



*Source: Historic Preservation Office, May 2021*